

| Criteria | Weight | Actual Interview Scores: Range 0 - 4 | | | Adjusted Scores | | | Total | Comments |
|--|-----------|---|------------|-----------|-----------------|------------|-----------|------------|---|
| | | B. Hall | I. Skinner | M. Taylor | B. Hall | I. Skinner | M. Taylor | | |
| 1 Competence across all areas of the business | 3 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 12 | The Board felt that a full range of competence across all aspects of the bid proposal were not demonstrated especially at a Director level. |
| 2 Health & Safety across all areas of the business | 3 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 12 | Some big gaps on the management of H&S for children and young people showed a lack of awareness in this major area of potential development. |
| 3 Staffing & Operating | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 10 | Strong on technical knowledge but some limitations on the marketing side of things especially as it tended to focus on a regional if not very local approach. |
| 4 Bike Hire Equipment | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 4 | Whilst they are strong on the core fleet element, a big weakness is that lack of understanding and vision for a diverse fleet that targets the less able. |
| 5 Customer Experience | 3 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 6 | 9 | 6 | 21 | Whilst at interview some considerable discussion was forthcoming on managing complaints, a sustainable model for diversifying the demographics of Dalby was lacking in detail and innovation. |
| 6 Business Plan | 3 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 6 | 9 | 6 | 21 | This was not answered well, but they did have some good ideas on product launches which would be an innovation on site. |
| 7 Increasing Visitor Numbers | 3 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 6 | 6 | 15 | Good local networks within Pickering but this area of questioning showed a real lack of understanding of other outlets on site eg Dalby shop. Very poor understanding of the FC and how it works. |
| 8 Engaging with User Groups | 2 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 6 | Inexperience and lack of understanding gave the Board no confidence in their ability to engage with diverse user groups effectively. |
| 9 Working Relationships | 3 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 6 | 3 | 12 | A poor response which showed a shallow and poorly researched knowledge of the FC and how a partnership may work. They did obviously have a good landlord tenant relationship. |
| 10 Skills | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 10 | Whilst the team has some obvious strengths technically in relation to bikes and hire, the full range of skills necessary to meet all aspects of the submission were not evident. |
| 11 Financial Offer | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 60 | |
| Totals | 30 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 51 | 67 | 65 | 183 | |

Dalby Bike Hire

Scoring Matrix

Big Bear Bikes

Pre Interviews

| Criteria | Weight | Scores: Range 0 - 4 | | | Adjusted Scores | | | Total | Comments |
|--|-----------|---------------------|---------------------|-----------|-----------------|------------|-----------|------------|----------|
| | | B. Hall | I. Skinner | M. Taylor | B. Hall | I. Skinner | M. Taylor | | |
| 1 Competence across all areas of the business | 3 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 6 | 12 | |
| 2 Health & Safety across all areas of the business | 3 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 6 | 6 | 15 | |
| 3 Staffing & Operating | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 10 | |
| 4 Bike Hire Equipment | 1 | 1 | 3 ³ ① | 2 | 1 | 1 | 2 | 4 | |
| 5 Customer Experience | 3 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 6 | 9 | 6 | 21 | |
| 6 Business Plan | 3 | 1 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 12 | 6 | 21 | |
| 7 Increasing Visitor Numbers | 3 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 3 | 6 | 6 | 15 | |
| 8 Engaging with User Groups | 2 | 1 | 2 | 2 | 2 | 4 | 4 | 10 | |
| 9 Working Relationships | 3 | 1 | 2 | 1 | 3 | 6 | 3 | 12 | |
| 10 Skills | 2 | 1 | 3 | 2 | 2 | 6 | 4 | 12 | |
| 11 Financial Offer | 5 | 4 | 4 | 4 | 20 | 20 | 20 | 60 | |
| Totals | 30 | | | | 48 | 77 | 67 | 192 | |

Mike Score Sheet Big Bear Bikes

Dalby Bike Hire

Scoring Matrix

Company: Big Bear Bikes

Assessor: MT

Scores: Range 0 - 4

Assessor:

| Criteria | Weight | Panel Lead | Score | Adjusted | Comments |
|--|-----------|------------|-----------|-----------|---|
| 1 Competence across all areas of the business | 3 | MT | 2 | 6 | Staff recruitment challenges - question interim arrangements if proposals don't work? |
| 2 Health & Safety across all areas of the business | 3 | BH | 2 | 6 | Require site specific H&S policy and RA for Dalby Bike hire. Light on proposed procedures for the dalby site. |
| 3 Staffing & Operating | 2 | MT | 2 | 4 | Wide range in bike fleet - it would be useful to have an idea of the proposed bike numbers? Limited marketing - link to local welcome tourist campaign. |
| 4 Bike Hire Equipment | 1 | BH | 2 | 2 | Minimum half-day hire - is this an issue? Suggested rates appear appropriate. Collaborative visitor survey with FC? Hire fleet text repeated from previous section! |
| 5 Customer Experience | 3 | BH | 2 | 6 | Full time mature staff - commendable but is this affordable and does it discriminate? Customer feedback forms and staff training. Week on conduit for key FC messages - not convinced that BBB really appreciate what is required? Suggested event programme and local club idea is positive. |
| 6 Business Plan | 3 | IS | 2 | 6 | Succinct overview of proposed activities. Financial data clearly presented. Income targets are high and with significant growth over the three years - is this a realistic view? What is the marketing spend? |
| 7 Increasing Visitor Numbers | 3 | IS | 2 | 6 | Marketing budget? Catchment area for local? Mini-bus = green! Online booking system worthwhile. General local focus - could do with a broader strategic focus. No evidence of engagement with other Dalby business units - appreciate the challenges as not currently on site! |
| 8 Engaging with User Groups | 2 | BH | 2 | 4 | Little detail in submission with events programmed repeated from earlier section. The cost based offer is a positive approach. Not convinced BBB appreciates what is required here. |
| 9 Working Relationships | 3 | IS | 1 | 3 | Misses the point - this appears to be more about business development and marketing. |
| 10 Skills | 2 | MT | 2 | 4 | Company clearly has retained specialist skills in it's existing workforce - not clearly conveyed in the text. |
| 11 Financial Offer | 5 | IS | 4 | 20 | Income predictions appear high but combination of ground rent and % scores highest of the three bids. |
| Totals | 30 | | 23 | 67 | |

Bridgely - Big Bear 15:10

Dalby Bike Hire

Scoring Matrix

| Criteria | Weight | Scores: Range 0 - 4 | | | | Adjusted Scores | | | | Total | Comments |
|--|-----------|---------------------|------------|-----------|-----------|-----------------|-----------|----------|----------|-----------|---|
| | | B. Hall | I. Skinner | M. Taylor | B. Hall | I. Skinner | M. Taylor | Total | | | |
| 1 Competence across all areas of the business | 3 | 1 | | | 3 | 0 | 0 | | | 3 | Very little confidence in the full range of competencies required. |
| 2 Health & Safety across all areas of the business | 3 | 1 | | | 3 | 0 | 0 | | | 3 | Citing review of H&S after one month of opening - not sufficient competency from the start. |
| 3 Staffing & Operating | 2 | 1 | | | 2 | 0 | 0 | | | 2 | Very short on detail especially with regards to marketing. No recognition of the brand ethos of the FC or Dalby. |
| 4 Bike Hire Equipment | 1 | 1 | | | 1 | 0 | 0 | | | 1 | Very limited range of disability bikes offered. Worryingly poor level of explanation of bikes suitable for the Dixons Hollow. |
| 5 Customer Experience | 3 | 2 | | | 6 | 0 | 0 | | | 6 | Good thought given to FC messaging. |
| 6 Business Plan | 3 | 1 | | | 3 | 0 | 0 | | | 3 | Very sparse business plan showing lack of experience and detail. No breakdown of timeline for opening. |
| 7 Increasing Visitor Numbers | 3 | 1 | | | 3 | 0 | 0 | | | 3 | Very limited realistic ideas for increasing visitor numbers. |
| 8 Engaging with User Groups | 2 | 1 | | | 2 | 0 | 0 | | | 2 | We asked for detail of how this has been done within existing businesses and this was not forthcoming to the level required. |
| 9 Working Relationships | 3 | 1 | | | 3 | 0 | 0 | | | 3 | No detail of how the relationship with the FC will be developed in practical terms eg no meeting frameworks. |
| 10 Skills | 2 | 1 | | | 2 | 0 | 0 | | | 2 | Skill base and back-up networks limited. |
| 11 Financial Offer | 5 | 4 | | | 20 | 0 | 0 | | | 20 | Suggesting that cap ex on building is split with FC. |
| Totals | 30 | 15 | 0 | 0 | 48 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 48 | |

Williamson, David

From: Skinner, Iain
Sent: 29 April 2012 13:46
To: Taylor, Mike
Cc: Hall, Bridgette
Subject: Dalby Cycle Hire scores

Mike my aggregated scores are as follows:

Pre interview Scores.

BIG Bear Bikes

| | | |
|-------------------|-------------|---|
| Competence | 3 | Need details on key workers qualifications |
| H&S | 6 | Lone wkg & CRB. Punctures and lost cyclists |
| Staffing | 4 | Discriminate against young and pt/women |
| Bike Hire Equip. | 3 | lack of adapted provision |
| Experience | 9 | |
| BP | 12 | Good |
| Increase Visit | 6 | Nothing innovative or new or link with vision for the site. |
| Engaging | 4 | Nothing on how |
| Wkg Relationships | 6 | Not much info on ptrship wkg with FC and NGOs |
| Skills | 6 | Good but no proof |
| Financial | 17.1 | I am sceptical of the strength of this marking system so have adjusted for weaknesses in the other parts of the BP. |
| Total | 76.1 | - Ignored |

Purple Mountain

| | | |
|----------------------------|--------------|---|
| - Competence track record? | 12 | Very good, how is recruitment and retention worked on and what is their |
| H&S | 10.5 | |
| Staffing | 7 | Compliant |
| - Bike Hire Equip. | 3.5 | Deducted ½ pt as closed more than other offers |
| Experience | 12 | Good but limited adapted bikes and why not done up until now? |
| BP | 12 | Not addressed impact on site numbers |
| Increase Visit | 12 | gd Mktng plan, no mention of quiet periods or shoulder months. |
| - Engaging | 6 | Good but why has this not happened before? |
| - Wkg Relationships | 6 | How to recover the FC relationship with local staff |
| Skills | 6 | ok |
| - Financial | 15 | Deducted 1 pt for weaknesses in the relationship with the FC |
| Total | 103.5 | |

CTC/Pace

| | | |
|---------------------------------|--------------|---|
| Competence | 10.5 | Bike hire gap identified and addressed |
| H&S | 10.5 | CRB in person spec but needs inc in H&S too. |
| Staffing | 8 | Good mix of skills and procedures |
| Bike Hire Equip. | 4 | Excellent adapted provision |
| Experience | 12 | Open all the time with good feedback |
| BP | 9 | OK needs more description on the different areas |
| Increase Visit | 12 | Excellent outreach and use of members |
| Engaging | 8 | Excellent outreach and method of delivery |
| Wkg Relationships organisations | 12 | Shown excellent wkg relationship with FC and other commercial and ptr |
| Skills | 7 | Good Mix with some strengthening identified. |
| Financial | 15.2 | OK and with the outreach/marketing I think it will be exceeded. |
| Total | 108.2 | |

Mike sorry this is late. See you Tuesday, enjoy the kids.

Iain

Iain Skinner BSc. (Hons), MRICS

04/05/2012